

John Garve Macleod of Raasay's Lament

I learnt this from Gillies and afterwards went through it with A. Cameron.

The Piobaireachd Society, following, I think, Donald Macdonald, and certainly "Ceol Mor", repeat the first line. This makes the arrangement of the tune usual. As it stands in A. MacKay's book it is unusual. I think that possibly the latter made a mistake in not repeating, the error being due to the method adopted for writing the first line which involves one repeat mark anyhow. I forgot to mention the point to A. Cameron. I have discussed it with Gillies and he says that, so far as he can remember, the Camerons accepted A. MacKay's setting without the repeat as correct. Certainly I think that I would not have missed being told by A. Cameron to repeat the line had he considered MacKay's book, which was before us at the time, to be wrong.

I have written the tune in 6/8 time which represents Cameron's way of playing better than the 3/4 time of MacKay. The double echoes are medium broken or, as I noted at the time of going through the tune with Cameron, half broken and half full.

Subsequent notes

10/2/21. Donald Macdonald's MS and Reid's MS¹ both repeat the first line. Donald Macdonald, junior, and Angus MacKay do not. Gillies can throw no further light. I have written to A. Cameron who was clear that the tune was a favourite with his father.

17/2/21. A. Cameron writes (15/2/21, letter filed in the "Glengarry's March" file in the collection) "John Garve was played by my father as it is in MacKay's Book."

27/3/26. Mrs. McLardy, daughter of Michael MacCarfrae² the Duke of Hamilton's piper, has a copy of MacKay's book in which there are various manuscript corrections. In the historical notes the name of each tune referred to is written in ink in Angus MacKay's handwriting and there is reason to surmise that the corrections in the score were or may have been made by Angus MacKay. The correcting hand has placed a symbol at the beginning and end of the first line from the doubling of the Taorluath onward (see my copy of MacKay) thus showing that the line should be repeated. I regard this as good authority for playing the repeat through the tune and bringing it into conformity with the other tunes of the same character.

[Editor's note:

In this nicely balanced state of the authorities the author showed the first line as repeated in Book 5 of the current Piobaireachd Society series (published in 1934) but reverted to the original Angus MacKay style in the Kilberry Book (published in 1948)]

1. P.S. Books 1 and 13, Prefaces. I.P. December 1980.
2. (1810-1881). P.S. Book 10, Introduction. P.T. March 1970. I.P. March 1980 (p.10).

1. Ground

LIV

John Game Method of Reasoning

Musical notation for 'Ground' in G major, 3/4 time. It consists of three staves. The first staff is the treble clef with a melody of eighth and sixteenth notes. The second and third staves are bass clefs with a rhythmic accompaniment of eighth notes. The piece ends with a double bar line.

2.5. Lior S

Musical notation for 'Lior S' in G major, 3/4 time. It consists of three staves. The first staff is the treble clef with a melody of eighth and sixteenth notes. The second and third staves are bass clefs with a rhythmic accompaniment of eighth notes. The piece ends with a double bar line.

4.6. Lior D. Cum D.

Musical notation for 'Lior D. Cum D.' in G major, 3/4 time. It consists of three staves. The first staff is the treble clef with a melody of eighth and sixteenth notes. The second and third staves are bass clefs with a rhythmic accompaniment of eighth notes. The piece ends with a double bar line.

4.7. Lior Jr. Cum Jr.

Musical notation for 'Lior Jr. Cum Jr.' in G major, 3/4 time. It consists of three staves. The first staff is the treble clef with a melody of eighth and sixteenth notes. The second and third staves are bass clefs with a rhythmic accompaniment of eighth notes. The piece ends with a double bar line.