

2017 Silver Medal Tunes

Notes from the Judges' Seminar on Sunday 9 April

Tunes from PS Book 16

Hail to My Country:

The grace noting in this tune has been simplified compared with the original as composed by General Thomason. It is, of course, acceptable to offer alternative settings to that in Book 16, but remember to advise the competition organisers well in advance of the competitions.

Lord Berisdale's Salute:

In the first print of Book 16 the doubling of variation 1 is wrongly shown as a 'conventional' doubling (i.e. with the theme notes repeated within dot & cut couplets) whereas the original version in Ceol Mor has the doubling identical to the singling, but with the cadences replaced by dot & cut couplets to low A and low G. The score for this version is [here](#)

For the purposes of the Silver Medal competition either version will be acceptable. If the 'conventional' approach is adopted, the dotted high As should have a high A strike.

In the source score, and in book 16, the low G connecting notes at phrase ends in the the dithis singling have an E gracenote; in the Taorluath and Crunluath Singlings there is no E gracenote. It is acceptable for an E gracenote to be played in these variations. The judge should be notified.

The Sword's Lament:

In the original version in John Smith's manuscript there is an E cadence on the first C of the four-note combinations in the second last bar of each line of the Urlar. It will be acceptable to play this if desired. This can be seen on the original MS [here](#)

Rev Dr Norman MacLeod's Lament:

No specific comments.

Tunes composed by Pipe Major Donald MacLeod

Cronan Phadruig Seamus:

Variation 1, line 1, bar 3: for consistency with the rest of the tune the F quaver should be E.

Lament for John Morrison of Assynt House:

Urlar, line 2, bar 6: the E requires a G gracenote.

Urlar doubling: In Donald MacLeod book 6 line 2 starts with C. It starts with an E in the Piobaireachd society 20th century collection. The C is considered to be an error, but will be accepted. The judge should be notified if C is played.

Taorluath singling: the E cadence notes are shown without gracenotes and the B cadence notes with D gracenotes. This was thought to be intentional on the part of the composer.

Taorluath singling: the B in the last bar requires a D gracenote.

Taorluath singling and doubling, line 3: the brackets indicating singlings and doublings are missing from the last two bars.

Lament for the Iolaire:

No specific comments.

Roderick MacDonald's Salute:

There are a number of possible inconsistencies in this tune which might be considered to be errors. These are as follows:

- the last bar of line 2 of variation 1 would be the same as the last bar of line 1
- the taorluath embellishment on low A in bar 2 of the first line of the Taorluath Doubling should be a tripling on low G then D gracenote to low A, to correspond with lines 2 and 3.
- the low A tripling at the start of bar 2 of line 3 of the Taorluath variations would be a tripling on B.

For the purposes of the Silver Medal competitions it will be acceptable to play the score as written or to make the changes outlined above.

There are also a number of obvious printing errors in the Crunluath variations.

Additional Notes:

Recordings of the four Donald MacLeod tunes, made at this year's Donald MacLeod Memorial Competition, and a recording of John MacLellan playing Dr Norman MacLeod's Lament are now on the Piobaireachd Society website [here](#) and [here](#).

Donald MacLeod's Piobaireachd Collection is now back in print.