

The setting in the new book 10 is taken from MacArthur. This setting is thought to pre-date that of Angus MacKay by about 20 years. The previous edition of book 10 was largely based on MacKay and there was a theory that MacKay copied the tune from MacArthur and converted it into his father's style of playing.

The grounds are basically the same, give or take small pointing or gracing differences.

Variation 1 is cast in 6/8 in MacArthur and in 4/4 by MacKay. MacKay achieved his 4/4 time by essentially adding 28 cadences over the three lines with the cadences not shown as cadences, but as beats.

Taking these 'cadences' out gives a fluent 6/8 melody.