

Sir James MacDonald Of The Isles Salute (PS Book 14 p467)

Composed by William MacDonald of Vallay.

P.S., Angus MacKay & Ceol Mor

These are very similar.

The main difference is the Siubhal & Tripling. First note of Bar 3 of all lines is Low G in MacKay & Ceol Mor and Low A in P.S.

P.S., Angus MacKay & Ceol Mor follow the timing of variation 1 for the T variation and play them "down".

Donald MacDonald Jnr manuscript: gives Ground only and with some significant differences:

He writes with no bar lines, and gives what we know as lines 2 & 3 as one long line.

It is unusual that the opening cadence is not written with the 3 grace-note turn.

Cadence E to low A has a D grace-note (bar 1 & each time that turn occurs) - apart from near the end of what we call line 3, when he writes it without the D grace-note and takes that grace-note forward to the following note of B.

Line 2 starts and continues through the Ground with high G - rather than high A. Again we don't know if this was intended as we only have his Ground. Places a G grace-note through F when going to E - rather than the standard G grace straight to E.

Peter Reid's Manuscript:

He opens the Ground with the 3 grace turn which he carries through all cadences.

Plays a G grace straight to low A after each B grip - rather than the G grace to E onto plain low A ala P.S.

He opens the 1st variation singling and doubling with the 3 note turn.

After the Ground his writing becomes quite erratic. The gracing in the 1st Variation and doubling are inconsistent. Thereafter, he writes a further variation that is difficult to follow.